To: The Haverford Community.
The following abstract describes a Dean's Panel inquiry convened to address a concern reported by the Security Office in 1988. The abstract was withheld until 1990 to maintain confidentiality. In this case, the gender of the people involved have not been changed in order to accurately reflect the nature of the incident.

A Dean's Panel is convened to address concerns "which are, legally, administratively concerns and at the same time student concerns socially," for example, drug dealing or sexual abuse. A Dean's Panel is composed of four members of Honor Council and a Dean. As in other trials, "the jury has the right to request that an individual be questioned out of the other's presence. For this action to take place, the confronted and confronting parties must give their consent."

1988 Honor Council Abstract: Quentin and Sunny

Summary: Sunny called Security to remove Quentin from her room after they began a heated argument. Security Officer Ulford found Quentin, Sunny, and two other students, Rodriguez and Theresa in Sunny's room. The officer asked Quentin to leave the room, and he complied. Subsequently, Officer Ulford made a security report and the incident was referred to the Dean of the College. Several factors warranted the assembling of a Dean's panel: a Security officer was called; violence was mentioned in the security report; there were implications of sexual harassment.

At the inquiry, the chairperson read the security report, which stated that there had been violence. Sunny and Quentin repeatedly stated that there had been no violence and that they had no intention of the matter going any further than between themselves. Rodriguez and Theresa both claimed they had felt that the atmosphere was full of the potential for violence and that there had been a violation of the Honor Code.

The panel concluded that there had been no violation of the Honor Code. It found no evidence of violence or sexual harassment in the incident addressed, which would warrant the continuation of a Dean's Panel. However, the panel made several recommendations:
1. There will be a mandatory mediation between all parties;
2. The mediation will take place within two weeks;
3. The panel strongly suggests that Sunny and Quentin seek counselling to alleviate the difficulties associated with the dissolution of their relationship;

1. The Honor Code, sec. II, F. "Jurisdiction".
2. The Honor Code, sec. II, C. "Trial Procedure".
4. The panel issued a warning to Quentin. In the future, the Dean of the college would have the right to review any incidents which arose concerning Quentin.

I. FACT-FINDING

At the inquiry, Sunny said that she and Quentin had recently broken off their romantic involvement. They had been arguing on Wednesday night. On Thursday, Quentin called Sunny and they had another argument. Quentin said he did not want to see Sunny again as a girlfriend, and left her in his room. She thought that meant that he wanted nothing more to do with her, so she removed all the clothes from his room which she bought for him as presents in the past.

Later that evening she got a phone call from Quentin saying he wanted the clothes back. She said she was busy and would return them later. Quentin called again, and said he wanted his clothes back immediately because their argument was distracting him from his studies. He then went to her room and waited outside the door. When Theresa, who was talking with Sunny, opened the door, Quentin entered the room. He began arguing with Sunny and took some of her clothes as "collateral" since she still refused to give him the clothes which he claimed were his. Sunny called Security and said that she "wanted something worked out". She said she "wanted a man removed" from her room. At the inquiry she said she called for a Security officer to act as an impartial party. Officer Ulford came and told Quentin to leave, which he did. Sunny said she had no intention of getting Honor Council or the Deans involved, however, the Dean of the College contacted Sunny on Friday on the basis of the Security Report.

Confronted party: Quentin said that "looking back with some perspective" it seems kind of silly to have been arguing over clothes. In response to the question from the panel regarding the Security Report which had mentioned violence at the incident, Quentin said that Officer Ulford was given a false impression that he, Quentin, had been physically violent on that night. Quentin stated that he had never been physically violent towards Sunny, nor had Quentin threatened Sunny. There had been no threats, no harm, nor abuse. They just wanted a resolution.

Sunny said she had called Security not because she felt threatened but because she knew Officer Ulford as a friend who would act impartially. In response to a question by a panel member, Sunny said that when Quentin first entered the room she felt he was violating her space but as they waited for Officer Ulford, she did not feel that way again.
Sunny and Quentin left the room. The panel felt that Officer Ulford's viewpoint would be helpful. At the inquiry, he explained that when he arrived in Sunny's room, there were four people already there: Sunny, Quentin, Rodriguez and Theresa. Sunny and Quentin were "very upset and very angry", and they were yelling. Officer Ulford said that Sunny said she was afraid of Quentin and that Quentin threatened her. He said that Quentin did not deny or react to Sunny's accusation of physical violence. Moreover, Quentin "really didn't want to leave"; Officer Ulford felt he needed to tell Quentin to leave in a firm voice. However, Officer Ulford did not witness any violence towards Sunny from Quentin. Officer Ulford, having given his account, left the room.

At this point there were several differences between the account given by Sunny and Quentin, and Officer Ulford's version:

a. Sunny and Quentin said that Quentin left "soon after" (two or three minutes) Officer Ulford arrived, but the officer said it had been about ten minutes.

b. Sunny and Quentin agreed that when Quentin left, he took some of Sunny's clothes with him. The officer had not seen that, but had the impression that Quentin left the room with some of Sunny's music tapes.

c. Officer Ulford indicated that Quentin seemed more upset than Sunny that this incident came to the attention of the Deans and that the incident might go on his record.

d. Officer Ulford sensed that Sunny was afraid of Quentin during the incident, which Sunny had denied to the panel.

e. Quentin and Sunny claimed they had been yelling at Officer Ulford and not one another; Officer Ulford claimed they had been yelling to one another at Officer Ulford.

In addition to these differences, the panel members wondered why Sunny had called Security if it was simply a matter of removing Quentin from her room, since there were two other students who could have helped her.

Sunny and Quentin returned to address the panel. Sunny said the issue of physical violence never arose that night. She said that her size and gender in relation to Quentin's was not the reason she had called the Security Office. She had called Officer Ulford to impartially resolve the issue since she felt Theresa and Rodriguez were too passive to handle the situation.

Quentin stated that he stood outside Sunny's room only to get his clothes back, without intent to threaten or confront Sunny.

Quentin and Sunny exited the room; the panel deliberated and found it needed to hear the accounts of the two witnesses of the episode, Rodriguez and Theresa.
Rodríguez and Theresa felt they could not speak freely with Quentin and Sunny in the room; Rodríguez was afraid for his own safety. However, Quentin and Sunny felt Rodríguez and Theresa were not impartial witnesses, thus, they refused to allow Rodríguez and Theresa to speak to the panel alone.

When the panel reconvened, Sunny, Quentin, Rodríguez and Theresa were present. According to Theresa, on the night in question, she came over to talk with Sunny. She claimed Sunny had called her to keep her company. Quentin called, and later, when Theresa opened the door to leave, Quentin pushed his way past Theresa into the room and took clothes from Sunny's closet. When Sunny stepped forward to stop Quentin, he pushed at Sunny with the hand holding her clothes. Theresa said Sunny was pushed backwards into a chair several feet away. Sunny then called Security. Officer Ulford arrived, Quentin left the room, and Theresa left soon after.

At this point in the inquiry Sunny broke in, saying she had not been pushed. Instead, she had fallen after losing her balance. She claimed that Theresa's view had been obstructed, reemphasizing that she and Quentin had not had any physical contact. Sunny added that she did not call Officer Ulford because of a threat or intention of violence.

Rodríguez, Quentin's suitemate, spoke next. On the night in question, Quentin told Rodríguez that some of his clothes were gone. Rodríguez went to talk to Sunny. Theresa was also in the room. When Theresa got up to leave, Quentin came in the room. Rodríguez saw Sunny move towards Quentin and saw her fall back, but he did not see what caused her loss of balance.

Theresa and Rodríguez agreed that Sunny called the Security Office after Quentin took Sunny's clothes from the closet and after the "pushing" incident. They also agreed that Officer Ulford was there approximately 2-3 minutes and that Quentin left before Theresa.

The panel began asking fact-seeking questions from Theresa. She was definitely sure that Quentin pushed Sunny with enough force to move Sunny from a standing to a sitting position, and it was then, she said, that Sunny began crying. Sunny denied that this had happened at the inquiry.

Theresa said the atmosphere was "very violent, very tense; you could feel the violence in the air". However, the feeling was not "scary". Theresa agreed when asked if the security report statement was a correct account and consistent with Quentin's character. Theresa told the panel that Sunny told her Quentin threatened to slash the tires on Sunny's car.
Sunny continued to deny Theresa’s statements. She maintained her own account was objective and accurate, and resisted the suggestion that she was subject to a “victim’s mentality” denouncing past actions, taking blame for Quentin’s actions on her own shoulders.

Quentin thought that Theresa’s statements were “outrageous” and the process was “frustrating”. He said, “I never threatened her (Sunny).” Sunny and Quentin felt they had already resolved the issue.

Rodriguez nervously answered some of the fact-seeking questions from the panel. He said he saw Sunny end up in the chair but not the actions leading up to that. He did not agree with the mention of violence on the Security Report.

Sunny, Quentin, and Theresa and Rodriguez left the room. The panel continued to deliberate but was yet unable to reach a conclusion. The panel felt uneasy that Sunny had withheld the incident of her falling into a chair in her first account and suspected she might be feeling intimidated by Quentin’s presence. Panel members were unsure that Rodriguez was not withholding information. The panel felt the need to hear more accounts from all parties.

The panel reconvened the next day. Quentin and Sunny would not agree to have Rodriguez and Theresa questioned without their presence. Thus, all four were again present. Rodriguez explained that he went to Sunny’s room because he was afraid of the potential for violence on Quentin’s part. He said it was not a question of Sunny losing her balance but that she was pushed into the chair. He added that he “was very frightened at the time”. Though he felt he had “nothing to gain” personally in terms of vengeance, he felt compelled to tell his story for the safety of all in the future.

The panel asked Rodriguez, “Did Quentin deliberately push Sunny?” Rodriguez said he “couldn’t see that directly” but that is what he and Theresa felt was the case. Rodriguez said Quentin had definitely pushed Theresa away from her position by the door as he entered Sunny’s room.

The panel asked why Rodriguez was frightened on that night. He said that on previous occasions, Sunny had told Rodriguez that Quentin hit her, thus, when Quentin found his clothes missing, Rodriguez was “frightened that someone might be hurt”. It was only because of this suspicion that he was afraid. However, he had never heard Quentin threaten Sunny directly until that night when he overheard Quentin on the telephone threatening to slash the tires on Sunny’s car. When asked why this statement had not come out before, Rodriguez admitted to withholding some of the truth the day before. He stated that he went to Sunny’s room that night
because he was "terrified of anyone being hit", not because of any obligation he felt under the Honor Code. Rodriguez said he had never directly heard or seen Quentin threaten or hit Sunny.

The panel continued to ask fact-seeking questions. Theresa said that before the incident, she never saw Quentin threaten or hit Sunny. However, like Rodriguez, Theresa had heard Sunny speak of previous instances of violence.

Sunny described her room's floor plan and said that Theresa had not been able to see what had happened from where she had stood. It was not a matter of Sunny being pushed into a chair three feet away; the chair was much closer and Sunny had not been struck. Sunny added that as far as she knew, Quentin had never threatened Rodriguez, and pointed out that she would not have confided in Rodriguez since she had never liked or trusted him.

Sunny, Quentin, Theresa and Rodriguez left the room. The panel came to consensus that there was enough evidence to determine if a violation had occurred and agreed that there was clearly no evidence of sexual harassment. Despite the Security Report, Officer Ulford did not see any violence or evidence supporting that conclusion. Sunny and Quentin consistently denied that any violence had occurred during the incident. Rodriguez did not see any violence directed at Sunny, and though Theresa stated that Quentin had hit Sunny, it could not be confirmed that she was in a position to accurately see Sunny and Quentin's actions. Though there had been indications of other incidents involving questionable behavior on Quentin's part, the panel was confined to examining only this incident. After further discussion, the panel consensed that this case did not warrant further investigation by the panel, since it could not be determined that there had been a violation of the Honor Code.

Conclusions

1. The panel found no evidence of violence in the incident addressed.

2. The panel found no evidence of sexual harassment in the incident.

3. The continuation of a Dean's panel was not warranted in this case.

Recommendations

1. There will be a mandatory mediation between all parties: Sunny, Quentin, Theresa and Rodriguez, which will be held within two weeks and mediated by two Honor Council members
from the Dean’s panel. A mediation between investigation members seemed necessary to reconcile the improprieties raised by the accusations made during the trial. Mediation might address topics such as the problems of people living together, the issue of threatening remarks and of intimidation, and resolution of past incidents of Quentin’s behavior which the panel could not address.

2. This panel recognizes the difficulties associated with the dissolution of Sunny’s and Quentin’s relationship, and strongly suggests they seek individual counselling.

3. The panel issues this warning: "Though we found no evidence of violence in this incident, it was alleged during the fact-finding portions of the investigation that there had been previous episodes in which Quentin displayed threatening behavior towards others; such behavior is unacceptable conduct in this community. Any repeated action of a similar nature in the future will be occasion for full review by the deans regarding Quentin’s status at the college."

Final: Quentin, Sunny, Rodriguez and Theresa returned. The chairperson read the conclusions and the recommendations. Quentin and Sunny nodded acceptance. The Dean’s panel inquiry ended.